

# Testimony on Performance of ELL and Immigrant Students in the NYC Public School System



**INDEPENDENT BUDGET OFFICE  
RAYMOND DOMANICO  
DIRECTOR, EDUCATION RESEARCH  
SEPTEMBER 27, 2012  
NYC COUNCIL HEARING**

# English Language Arts (ELA) and Math Results Grades 3-8 2010-2011

2

- Students are classified as English language learners (ELL) due to low English language proficiency. As a result, ELL students have much lower ELA scores than non-ELL students.
- In Math, ELL students also have lower performance scores, on average. The difference is most notable at the high and low end of the performance levels – levels 1 and 4.

	English Language Arts		Math	
	ELL	Non-ELL	ELL	Non-ELL
<b>Number Tested</b>	56,077	361,121	64,136	361,643
<b>Performance Level</b>				
<b>1</b>	38.5%	9.3%	20.9%	7.5%
<b>2</b>	49.1%	41.8%	44.6%	31.0%
<b>3</b>	12.3%	45.8%	27.8%	38.0%
<b>4</b>	0.1%	3.1%	6.7%	23.5%
<b>Pct of Population Untested</b>	12.6%	0.4%	0.2%	0.3%

# ELA AND MATH TEST SCORES BY IMMIGRANT STATUS

- Though the differences are not large, immigrant students in grades 3 – 8 score lower than U.S. born students.

	English Language Arts		Math	
	Immigrant	US Born*	Immigrant	US Born*
<b>Number Tested</b>	57,693	358,982	65,614	359,610
<b>Performance Level:</b>				
<b>1</b>	20.7%	12.0%	12.9%	8.9%
<b>2</b>	40.3%	43.2%	31.2%	33.4%
<b>3</b>	36.7%	42.0%	34.0%	36.9%
<b>4</b>	2.3%	2.7%	21.9%	20.8%
<b>Pct. Of Population Untested</b>	12.2%	0.5%	0.2%	0.3%

\*Includes students born in US Territories.  
Excludes 558 students with unknown place of birth.

# High School Graduation Results

4

- **Graduating Class of 2009:**
  - ELL students had a lower overall graduation rate and were much less likely to earn Regents diplomas.
  - ELL graduates were half as likely as non-ELL graduates to score at college-ready levels on both the ELA and Math Regents.
  - Immigrant students were more likely to graduate, earn Regents diplomas and score at college-ready levels in both ELA and Math than students born in the U.S.

## Graduation Class of 2009 - English Language Learners (ELL) and Immigrant Students

5

	ELL	Non-ELL	U.S. Born*	All Immigrants
Analysis Cohort (N)	7,999	64,558	52,418	20,029
All Graduates (N)	3,668	44,038	34,201	13,438
Graduation Rate	45.9%	68.2%	65.3%	67.1%
Regents Graduates (N)	1,881	33,482	25,332	9,967
Regents Graduation Rate	23.5%	51.9%	48.3%	49.8%
	% of all graduates:			
College Ready - English	25.8%	63.7%	61.7%	58.5%
College Ready - Math	28.4%	37.0%	33.9%	42.5%
College Ready - Both	13.8%	32.3%	29.5%	34.4%

\*Includes students from US Territories.

110 students, including 67 graduates, not included because birthplace unknown.

# Program Placement of English Language Learner Students, 2010-11

6

Number of Years in Program	Bilingual		Dual Language		English as a Second Language Only		Special Education/ Individualized Educational Program	
	Number	Cumulative Percentage	Number	Cumulative Percentage	Number	Cumulative Percentage	Number	Cumulative Percentage
1	9,137	32.8	1,953	31.9%	26,770	24.5	1,723	25.1
2	7,222	58.7	1,512	56.6	22,792	45.3	1,006	26.3
3	3,971	72.9	875	70.9	14,921	58.9	1,315	38.9
4	2,725	82.7	718	82.6	12,813	70.6	1,262	51.1
5	1,753	89.0	477	90.4	9,845	79.6	1,200	62.6
6	1,147	93.1	293	95.2	7,159	86.2	1,188	74.1
7	599	95.2	167	97.9	4,949	90.7	901	82.7
8	438	96.8	65	98.9	3,468	93.9	678	89.3
9	291	97.9	54	99.8	2,464	96.1	517	94.2
10	222	98.7	7	99.9	1,568	97.5	338	97.5
11	153	99.2	4	100.0	1,125	98.6	158	99.0
12	94	99.5		100.0%	674	99.2	64	99.6
Over 12	129	100.0%		100.0%	893	100.0%	40	100.0%
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>27,881</b>	<b>18.1%</b>	<b>6,125</b>	<b>4.0%</b>	<b>109,441</b>	<b>71.1%</b>	<b>10,390</b>	<b>6.8%</b>

**NYC Independent Budget Office**  
**Testimony to NYC Council Hearing on Immigrants and ELL Students**  
**September 27, 2012**  
**Supplemental Table**

**Graduating Class of 2009 - Detailed Outcomes for Immigrant Students**

	All Graduates	College Ready English	College Ready Math	College Ready Math and English
<b>U.S. Born</b>	<b>33,881</b>	<b>61.8%</b>	<b>34.0%</b>	<b>29.7%</b>
<b>Born Outside U.S.</b>	<b>13,438</b>	<b>58.5%</b>	<b>42.5%</b>	<b>34.4%</b>
<b>U.S. Territories</b>	<b>320</b>	<b>47.2%</b>	<b>18.8%</b>	<b>14.4%</b>
<b>Unknown</b>	<b>67</b>	<b>61.2%</b>	<b>52.2%</b>	<b>35.8%</b>
<b>Americas</b>				
United States	33,881	61.8%	34.0%	29.7%
Caribbean	4,185	46.2%	20.7%	16.2%
South America	1,825	54.5%	31.2%	25.3%
Mexico	405	47.4%	26.7%	20.0%
US Territories	320	47.2%	18.8%	14.4%
Central America	286	41.3%	21.3%	17.8%
Canada	73	68.5%	27.4%	24.7%
<b>Asia - TOTAL</b>	<b>4,332</b>	<b>68.3%</b>	<b>68.4%</b>	<b>54.3%</b>
East Asia	2,075	65.4%	80.7%	58.8%
South Asia	1,627	71.4%	57.4%	50.8%
West Asia - Middle East	202	56.9%	45.0%	37.6%
Southeast Asia	280	75.4%	60.7%	52.1%
Central Asia	148	76.4%	64.2%	56.1%
<b>Europe - TOTAL</b>	<b>1,552</b>	<b>78.0%</b>	<b>55.1%</b>	<b>50.0%</b>
Eastern Europe	1,058	82.2%	61.5%	56.8%
Southern Europe	348	67.8%	40.5%	34.2%
Northern Europe	87	74.7%	50.6%	44.8%
Western Europe	59	67.8%	32.2%	28.8%
<b>Africa - TOTAL</b>	<b>769</b>	<b>52.3%</b>	<b>33.9%</b>	<b>26.8%</b>
West Africa	546	49.3%	30.2%	23.1%
North Africa	135	60.7%	48.9%	40.0%
East Africa	46	63.0%	50.0%	41.3%
Middle Africa	31	45.2%	12.9%	12.9%
Southern Africa	11	72.7%	27.3%	27.3%
<b>Oceania</b>	<b>11</b>	<b>81.8%</b>	<b>45.5%</b>	<b>45.5%</b>

SOURCE: IBO analysis of Department of Education data on individual student records